Revisiting (adjectival) resultatives in Old Romance

Víctor Acedo-Matellán (Oriel College, University of Oxford), Josep Ausensi (Universitat Pompeu Fabra), Josep M. Fontana (Universitat Pompeu Fabra), Cristina Real Puigdollers (Universitat Pompeu Fabra)

1. In this paper, we discuss a construction found in Old Spanish corpora (12th-16th c., data extracted from Sánchez-Marco et al. 2009 (SM) and Corpus del Español (CES)) that can be identified with an adjectival resultative construction (cf. John shot him dead).

(1) a. Et lo fírilo de vna lança por el uientre en tal manera
and ACC.3SG.M hurt.3SG.PFFV of a spear through the stomach in such way
lo derivative muerto d el cauallo
ACC.3SG.M knock-down.3SG.PFFV dead.PTCP.3SG.M of the horse
Lit. ‘And [he] hurt him with a spear through his stomach in such a way that he knocked him dead off the horse’ (14th c., SM)

b. Non la despoje desnuda e la dexe
No ACC.3SG.F strip.3SG.SBJV naked.PTCP.3SG.F and ACC.3SG leave.3SG.SBJV
como el dia en que nasçio.
lit. like the day in that born.3SG.PFFV
‘May he not strip her naked and leave her like the day she was born’ (14th c., SM)

2. Building on Acedo-Matellán’s (2010, 2016) reappraisal of Talmy’s (1991, 2000) typological classification, we distinguish two main classes of languages depending on how they express the change of location/state subevent that we label as Path (following Acedo-Matellán 2010, 2016, Acedo-Matellán and Mateu 2013): satellite-framed languages and verb-framed languages. In the first class, Path can receive exponence through a non-verbal element (2), while in the second class, Path is obligatorily expressed through the verb (3).

(2) The boat floated into the cave (3) La botella entró en la cueva flotando
The bottle enter.PST.3SG in the cave floating
‘The bottle got into the cave floating’

In Latin, as in other weak satellite-framed languages, in the sense of Acedo-Matellán (2010, 2016), with agreeing adjectives, both strong and weak adjectival resultatives (cf. The joggers ran the pavement thin; John wiped the table clean respectively) are nonexistent (Acedo-Matellán 2010, 2016). Lastly, Modern Romance constitute a pure verb-framed language in which adjectival resultatives are absent (cf. Spanish: Juan fregó la mesa brillante ‘Juan wiped the table shiny’ (aDepictive/ Resultative). In this context, the alleged existence of adjectival resultative constructions in Old Romance varieties are puzzling, since it shows that languages can belong to many different types along their evolutionary history.

3. Troberg and Burnett (2014) provide examples of adjectival resultatives in Old French (e.g. Andeus les geta mors en mi la pree ‘He beat both of them dead in the middle of the field.’ (Troberg and Burnett 2014:45)) (see Troberg 2017, and Troberg and Burnett 2014, 2017). These authors provide a punctual model of the diachronic variation in three stages each of which display a different resultative system: (i) the Latin stage with prefixed prepositional resultatives (Talmy 1985), (ii) the Old Romance stage with unprefixed prepositional resultatives and weak adjectival resultatives and (iii) the final stage in which secondary predication resultatives, either prepositional and adjectival, are absent. In this work, we provide arguments from Old Spanish that put into question their conclusion. We propose instead that Old and Modern stages of Romance belong both to the verb-framed type. However, we acknowledge the fact that there might be microparametric differences that may explain the different distribution of constructions among different varieties.

4. We provide evidence that the examples in (1) are not true adjectival resultative constructions of the type found in satellite-framed languages or some verb-framed languages (Japanese; Washio 1997). First, the adjective in these constructions is an adjunct, as it can appear with other modifiers expressing other results (e.g. a tierra ‘to the ground’) (4).

(4) lo abatió a tierra muerto
ACC.3SG.M knock-down.3SG.PFFV to earth dead.PTCP.3SG.M
Lit. ‘He was knocked dead to the ground’ (14th c., SM)
Second, these constructions diverge from weak adjectival resultatives (Washio 1997) in permitting adjectives that introduce a distinct result state than the one encoded by the verb. English weak adjectival resultative constructions only permit adjectives that further specify the result state encoded by the verb (cf. John froze the soup hard/solid vs. *John froze the soup valueless/small), (Levin and Rappaport Hovav 1995; Rappaport Hovav and Levin 1998, 2010; Beavers 2011). In contrast, in OSp constructions the adjective introduces a distinct result state than the one encoded by the verb: whereas derribar ‘knock-down’ encodes a change along a location scale (i.e. a change of location), muerto ‘dead’ denotes a change along a property scale (Beavers 2011), namely a change of state. Third, all the adjectives in these constructions found in the corpora can also appear in passives showing that they display participial properties (see Bosque 1990), which contrasts with Modern Spanish since this possibility is absent (cf. *Fue muerto por su hermano lit. ‘He was dead by his brother’).

(5) a. Fueron muertos por su hermano de asdrubal
   be.3PL.PVF dead.3PL.M.PTCP by his brother of asdrubal
   ‘They were killed by Asdrubal’s brother’ (Lit. Were dead by his brother) (14th c., SM)

b. Fue desnuda y mal herida con escorpiones
   be.3SG.PVF naked.3SG.F.PTCP and bad hurt.3SG.F.PTCP with scorpions
   ‘She was undressed and badly hurt with scorpions’ (Lit. Was naked) (14th c., SM)

Crucially, participles denoting a resultative event cannot appear in true resultative secondary predications, as shown in the contrast between Eng. kick the door open vs. *kick the door opened (Embellk 2004). Similarly, if the OSp constructions in (1) were true adjectival resultative constructions, it would suppose a problem for the general restriction that two distinct result states (cf. *John broke the vase valueless/small | *John knocked him to the ground dead) cannot be predicated of the same entity within a single clause (Goldberg 1991; Tenny 1994; Levin and Rappaport Hovav 1995; Tortora 1998), since the adjective (i.e. muerto) denotes a result state that is distinct from the one encoded by the verb (e.g. derribar).

5. Our analysis of these constructions draws on the observation that those adjectives are participial with the structure in (7):

(6) Firio lo ansí mortalmente que lo derribo muerto
   Hurt ACC.3SG.M like deadly that ACC.3SG.M knock-down.3SG.PVF dead.3SG.M.PTCP
   ‘[He] hurt him like this, deadly, that he knocked him dead’ (15th c., SM)


Thus, the secondary predication in Old Spanish is a participle of a change of state verb with its own argument structure. Hence, the subject of the adjunct participial clause is a PRO controlled by the object of the main clause, accounting for the existence of two result states predicated of the same entity and resulting from two different events.

6. Our study provides arguments against the analysis of these constructions as weak adjectival resultatives. In doing so, we solve the puzzle raised by Burnett and Troberg (2013, 2014) that there are three completely different stages in the evolution of resultatvity from Latin to Modern French. As a result, contra proponents of gradual change (Stolova 2008, Kopecka 2009, Iacobini and Fagard 2011, i.a.), or proponents of punctuated change (Burnett and Troberg 2014) in three stages, we argue that Old Romance and Modern Romance do not belong to two different types with respect to the expression of resultativity, and that the distribution of the constructions studied here depends on a different set of conditions, crucially though not related to the satellite/verb-framed parameter.